

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA
HUNTINGTON DIVISION**

PAMELA D. SMITH, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

**CIVIL ACTION NO: 3:13-cv-14207
Honorable Robert C. Chambers**

FORD MOTOR COMPANY,

Defendant.

**FORD MOTOR COMPANY’S MEMORANDUM
IN RESPONSE TO MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE**

Ford Motor Company (“Ford”) states as follows in response to Plaintiffs’ motion pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a) to consolidate this action with *Belville, et al. v. Ford Motor Company*, Civil Action No. 3:13-cv-6529 (hereinafter “*Belville*”). Ford adopts and incorporates by reference as if fully set forth herein the arguments made in Ford’s Memorandum in Response to Motion to Consolidate filed in *Belville*. *Belville*, ECF Doc. No. 36 (“*Belville* Response”). As set forth in more detail in the *Belville* Response, Ford agrees that there will be a need for coordinated handling of certain aspects of these cases to avoid duplicative discovery and for purposes of judicial economy; however, Ford cannot consent to the consolidation of these actions pursuant to Rule 42 as proposed by Plaintiffs because none of these claims can be tried on a class-wide basis.

Respectfully submitted,

FORD MOTOR COMPANY

By Counsel

/s/ Michael Bonasso

Michael Bonasso (WV Bar No. 394)
William J. Hanna (WV Bar No. 5518)
Susan W. Romaine (WV Bar No. 9936)
Bradley J. Schmalzer (WV Bar No. 11144)
Flaherty Sensabaugh Bonasso PLLC
P.O. Box 3843
Charleston, WV 25338-3843
Telephone: (304) 344-4259
Facsimile: (304) 345-0260
mbonasso@fsblaw.com
whanna@fsblaw.com
sromaine@fsblaw.com
bschmalzer@fsblaw.com

J. Tracy Walker, IV
Tennille J. Checkovich
S. Virginia Bondurant
McGuireWoods LLP
One James Center
901 East Cary Street
Richmond, VA 23219-4030
Telephone: (804) 775-1131
Facsimile: (804) 698-2201
twalker@mcguirewoods.com
Pro Hac Vice Admission Applications Pending

Peter J. Fazio
**Aaronson Rappaport Feinstein &
Deutsch, LLP**
600 Third Avenue
5th Floor
New York, NY 10016
Telephone: (212) 593-5458
Facsimile: (212) 593-6970
pjfazio@arfdlaw.com
Pro Hac Vice Admission Application Pending

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA
HUNTINGTON DIVISION**

PAMELA D. SMITH, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

CIVIL ACTION NO: 3:13-cv-14207

Honorable Robert C. Chambers

FORD MOTOR COMPANY,

Defendant.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Michael Bonasso, do hereby certify that, on this 19th day of July 2013, I filed a true and correct copy of the above and foregoing **FORD MOTOR COMPANY'S** **MEMORANDUM IN RESPONSE TO MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE** with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to the following counsel for Plaintiffs:

Niall A. Paul (WV Bar No. 5622)
Spilman, Thomas & Battle, PLLC
300 Kanawha Boulevard, East (25301)
P.O. Box 273
Charleston, WV 25321
Telephone (304) 340-3800
Facsimile (304) 340-3801
npaul@spilmanlaw.com

Nathan B. Atkinson (WV Bar No. 10757)
Spilman, Thomas & Battle, PLLC
110 Oakwood Drive, Suite 500
Winston-Salem, North Carolina 25321
Tel: (336) 725-4710
Fax: (336) 725-4476
natkinson@spilmanlaw.com

Adam J. Levitt
John E. Tangren
Grant & Eisenhofer P.A.
30 North LaSalle Street, Suite 1200
Chicago, Illinois 60602
Tel: (312) 214-0000
Fax: (312) 214-0001
alevitt@gelaw.com
jtangren@gelaw.com

Mark DiCello
Robert F. DiCello
The Dicello Law firm
Western Reserve Law Building
7556 Mentor Avenue
Mentor, Ohio 44060
Tel: (440) 953-8888
Fax: (440) 953-9138
markdicello@dicellolaw.com
rfdicello@dicellolaw.com

Guy R. Bucci (WV Bar No. 0521)
Timothy C. Bailey (WV Bar No. 5839)
Lee Javins (WV Bar No. 6613)
Bucci Bailey & Javins L.C.
213 Hale Street
Charleston, West Virginia 25301
Tel: (304) 932-4639
Fax: (304) 345-0375
Gbucci@BBJLC.com
Timbailey@BBJLC.com
Ljavins@BBJLC.com

James R. Bartimus
Stephen M. Gorny
**Bartimus, Frickleton,
Robertson & Gorny, P.C.**
11150 Overbrook Road, Suite 200
Leawood, Kansas 66211
Tel: (913) 266-2300
Fax: (913) 266-2366
jb@bflawfirm.com
steve@bflawfirm.com

John T. Murray
Murray and Murray Co., L.P.A.
111 East Shoreline Drive
Sandusky, Ohio 44870
Tel: (419) 624-3000
Fax: (419) 624-0707
jotm@murrayandmurray.com

John Scarola
C. Calvin Warriner III
**Searcy, Denney, Scarola,
Barnhart & Shipley PA**
2139 Palm Beach Lakes Boulevard
West Palm Beach, Florida 33409
Tel: (800) 780-8607
Fax: (561) 686-6300
jsx@searcylaw.com
ccw@searcylaw.com

Joseph J. Siprut
Aleksandra M.S. Vold
Siprut P.C.
17 North State Street, Suite 1600
Chicago, Illinois 60602
Tel: (312) 236-0000
Fax: (312) 948-9212
jsiprut@siprut.com
avold@siprut.com

Keith G. Bremer
Alison K. Hurley
Benjamin L. Price
**Bremer, Whyte, Brown
& O'Meara LLP**
20320 S.W. Birch Street, Second Floor
Newport Beach, California 92660
Tel: (949) 221-1000
Fax: (949) 221-1001
kbremer@bremerwhyte.com
ahurley@bremerwhyte.com
bprice@bremerwhyte.com

E. Powell Miller
Richard L. Merpi II
The Miller Law Firm, P.C.
950 West University Drive, Suite 300
Rochester, Michigan 48307
Tel: (248) 841-2200
Fax: (248) 652-2852
epm@millerlawpc.com
rlm@millerlawpc.com

Grant L. Davis
Timothy C. Gaarder
Davis, Bethune & Jones, LLC
1100 Main Street, Suite 2930
Kansas City, Missouri 64105
Tel: (816) 421-1600
Fax: (816) 472-5972
gdavis@dbjlaw.net
tgaarder@dbjlaw.net

Edgar F. Heiskell, III (WV Bar No. 1668)
Attorney at Law
Post Office Box 3232
Charleston, West Virginia 25332
Tel: (304) 989-4459
heiskell.action@ymail.com

Gregory M. Travalio
Mark H. Troutman
Isaac, Wiles, Burkholder & Teetor LLC
Two Miranova Place, Suite 700
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Tel: (614) 221-2121
Fax: (614) 365-9516
gtravalio@isaacwiles.com
mtroutman@isaacwiles.com

John H. Gomez
Stephanie Poli
Gomez & Iagmin
655 West Broadway, Suite 1700
San Diego, California 92101
Tel: (619) 237-3490
Fax: (619) 237-3496
john@thegomezfirm.com
stephanie@thegomezfirm.com

V. Paul Bucci, II
Laffey, Bucci & Kent, LLP
1435 Walnut Street, 7th Floor
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19102
Tel: (215) 399-9255
Fax: (215) 241-8700
Pbucci@laffeybuccikent.com

/s/ Michael Bonasso
Michael Bonasso (WV Bar. No. 394)